

MEMO			
TO:	Board of Directors	FROM:	Gerry Carty
CC:		DATE:	9 November 2000
SUBJECT : Technical Committee Report on Objections to Proposed Decision - Reg. No. 3-2.			

Application Details	
Applicant:	South Dublin County Council
Location of Activity:	Ballymount Baling Station, Ballymount Road, Walkinstown, Dublin 12
Reg. No.:	3-2
Licensed Activities under Waste Management Act 1996:	Third Schedule: Classes 12 & 13 Fourth Schedule: Classes 3, 4 & 13
Proposed Decision issued on:	4/7/00
Objections received:	27/7/00 (also note submission of 12/6/00)
Submissions on objections received:	
Inspector:	Dr. Ted Nealon

Consideration of the objections and submissions on objections

The Technical Committee (Gerry Carty; Chairperson, Donal Howley and Kevin McDonnell committee members) has considered all of the issues raised and this report details the Committee's comments and recommendations following our examination of the objections.

Objections and submissions on objections received

One objection to the proposed decision was received from the Greenpark Residents Association.

Objection from the Greenpark Residents Association

Basis for objection & Summary

The Greenpark Residents Association have included four main grounds in their objection:

1. *Odours*
2. *Noise*
3. *Inadequate management of the facility*
4. *Management renegeing on written guarantees given to the residents and the Waste Management Plan for Dublin outlining three baling facilities in Dublin.*

These four grounds will be addressed individually below as they impact on the PD.

Background & Overview

The existing licence for Ballymount Baling Station (ref. 3-1) was issued on 7th October 1998. The enforcement of the licence has been problematic with the main issue relating to odour nuisance. The primary cause of the odour nuisance is the acceptance of quantities of waste at the facility, well in excess of the quantity licensed. The existing licence allows for the acceptance of 180,000 tonnes of waste per annum for baling. The facility accepted in the region of 300,000 tonnes of waste for baling in 1999 [268,373.4 tonnes were accepted and baled in the ten month period from January to October 1999 - Table 5.5 of Annual Environmental Report (received 19/07/00)]. It is estimated that at the current rate of acceptance the facility will accept in the region of 350,000 tonnes of waste for baling in 2000.

Recent inspections at the facility and correspondence from the licensee show that the facility as it is currently operated is unable to process the quantities currently being accepted at the facility within the existing operating hours [Table 1 below details baling capacities based on available information (from the licensee and site inspections)]. The failure of the County Council to operate the baling plant for the hours authorised under the existing licence (approx. 6-8 hours versus the 11 hours/day available) has led to the holding of waste in the reception hall, odours and complaints. The Dublin Waste Management Plan refers to the reliable capacity of the facility as 220,000 tonnes per annum. It is noted that the licensee received twenty four complaints relating to odours from the facility in 1999 and one hundred and five in 2000 up to 10th October 2000.

Table 1: **Baling Capacities**

No. of balers on site <small>Note 1</small>	No. of balers in operation (Duty Units)	Number of balers on standby	Standby Capacity	Hours of operation <small>Note 2</small>	Hourly capacity (tonnes/hour)	Daily Capacity (tonnes/day)
2	2	0	0%	11	96	1,056
2	1	1	100%	11	48	528
2	1	1	100%	24	48	1,152
3	2	1	50%	24	96	2,304

Note 1: There are currently two balers on site.

Note 2: Existing licence allows for 11 hours operation.

The licensee has issued to the EPA in the region of forty notifications of incidents relating to the facility, with the majority relating to the quantities of wastes accepted at the facility and ensuing breaches of the licence such as having large quantities of unbaled waste left on the facility floor overnight and having more than eight containers filled with baled waste overnight. Other notifications of incidents relate to *inter alia*, breaches of surface water and foul sewer ELVs and the management of the facility.

The Agency has issued nine Notifications of Non-Compliance to the licensee. These primarily relate to non-compliances regarding waste quantities accepted at the facility and other associated non-compliances, breaches of ELVs for surface water and foul sewer discharges, the acceptance of green waste at the Civic Waste Facility and changes in management without the prior agreement of the Agency.

The Agency has audited the facility on two occasions and non-compliances were recorded as referred to above [Appendix III contains copies of the Audit Reports].

Ground 1: Odours

The Greenpark Residents Association stated that the levels of foul odours emanating from the Ballymount Baling Station are totally unacceptable to the residents.

Technical Committee's evaluation

The Technical Committee notes that Condition 6.11 of the PD provides for the operation and maintenance of an odour control system at the facility. However, a large number of complaints have been received by the Agency and by the licensee regarding odour nuisance from the facility. In correspondence to the Agency, the licensee referred to having received 129 complaints relating to odour nuisance 1st January 1999 and 10th October 2000. Twenty four of these complaints were received in 1999 with the remaining one hundred and five received in 2000. From examination of the complaints dealing with odours, the site inspection reports for the facility, the inspector's report that accompanied the PD being objected to and inspection of the facility by members of the Technical Committee, the Technical Committee considers that there are two issues to be addressed in regard to the odours.

The first issue relates to the capacity of the facility to bale all of the waste received on a daily basis. Due to the quantities of waste being accepted at the facility (well in excess of the existing licence limit - estimated to be in the order of twice the licence limit for this year) the two balers are operating above their design capacity and frequent machine failure occurs. This unscheduled downtime together with operation of the balers for less hours than allowed under the existing licence has resulted in unbaled waste remaining on the floor of the waste treatment building overnight resulting in non-compliance with the licence. As of the 9th November 2000 there have been in the order of forty incident notifications with twenty five of these pertaining to waste having been left overnight on the floor of the waste treatment building. A site inspection conducted on 22nd August [see Appendix IV] also noted that from the 4th to the 8th of August 2000 between 320 tonnes and 600 tonnes of waste was being stored overnight either in trailers or on the floor of the reception building.

The second issue is the current odour management system. The Technical Committee considers that this system (Condition 6.11) is an odour masking system and not an odour control system, and indeed some of the odour complaints have been in relation to the nuisance caused by the masking agent employed. This system results in high water usage and damp working conditions which are giving rise to electrical control equipment failures on the baling plant.

The licensee has applied to extend the operating hours of the facility such that late night collections can be facilitated and waste can be processed (baled) 24 hours per day [Chapter 4 of the EIS (page 46) received as part of the application]. Currently, the baling facility is licensed to operate from 7.30 to 18.30 Monday to Saturday, with the PD proposing to allow for 24 hour operation of the facility, 7 days a week. The licensee has also increased the dosage of the masking agent and employed another masking product which it considers does not have an odour.

In order to adequately deal with the odour issue the Technical Committee recommends the inclusion of Condition 4.20 below which specifies the need for 100% duty capacity for the waste handling and ventilation equipment with 50% standby capacity, and that a negative air pressure emissions control system be installed and maintained in the reception area of the waste treatment building. In conjunction with this condition the Technical Committee recommends a number of other new conditions and additions to the Schedules of the PD with regard to emission limits and the monitoring of odour emissions and air quality and these are detailed below.

Recommendation

Insert new Condition 4.20:

4.20 Waste Handling and ventilation plant

- 4.20.1** Items of plant deemed critical to the efficient and adequate processing of waste on site (including inter alia waste loading vehicles, storage containers and sorting lines) shall be provided on the following basis:
- 100% duty capacity;
 - 50% standby capacity;
 - provision of contingency arrangements and/or back-up and spares in the case of breakdown of critical equipment.
- 4.20.2** Within three months of issue of this license, the licensee shall provide a report for the agreement of the Agency detailing the capacity in tonnes per hour and tonnes per day, of all waste handling and processing equipment to be used on site. These capacities shall be based on the licensed waste intake, as per Schedule G, and shall be updated annually.
- 4.20.3** The quantity of waste to be accepted at the facility on a daily basis shall not exceed the duty capacity of the equipment on site. Any exceedance of this intake shall be treated as an incident and reported to the Agency under Condition 10.6.
- 4.20.4** The licensee shall within 3 months of the date of licence, submit a proposal to install and maintain a negative air pressure and emissions control system in the reception area of the waste Treatment Building. This system, as agreed with the Agency, shall be installed within a time frame to be agreed with the Agency.

Insert new Condition 7.4:

- 7.4** The licensee shall ensure that all operations on-site are carried out in a manner such that air emissions or odours do not result in a significant impact beyond the site boundary. Air emissions from the emissions control system required under condition 4.20.4 shall not exceed the emission limit values set out in Schedule F: Emission Limits of this licence.

Insert new Condition 9.10:

- 9.10.1** Within 3 months of the date of grant of this licence, the licensee shall submit to the Agency for agreement, an odour assessment of the entire activity on-site. This odour assessment shall, as a minimum include:
- identification and quantification of all significant odour releases;
 - the examination of all locations where wastes are deposited, processed or stored to determine measures for the containment and minimisation of odours; and
 - the use of a negative air pressure extraction and emissions control system in preventing the emission of odours from the facility.

New Insertion to Schedule B: [see Appendix I]

New Insertion to Table C.1 of Schedule C: [see Appendix I]

New Insertion into Schedule D: [see Appendix I]

New Insertion into Schedule E: [see Appendix I]

New Insertion for Schedule F: [see Appendix I]

Ground 2: Noise

The Greenpark Residents Association objected to the noise levels generated by reversing trucks, tipping of loads and the high pitch of the truck reversing beacons and state that these are extremely irritating and unacceptable.

Technical Committee's evaluation

The technical committee consider that noise, specifically the tonal or impulsive component of the noise emissions from the facility must be controlled. Condition 7.6 of the PD states that there should be no clearly audible tonal component or impulsive component in the noise emission from the activity at the facility boundary. However, the committee recommends two other changes to the PD with regard to noise control at the facility. Firstly, the use of full length, overlapping, clear plastic sheeting on the doors of the facility will help contain the noise levels within the waste treatment building. Secondly, the inclusion of frequency band analysis in the noise monitoring and specifying a limit of the maximum noise source component will facilitate the control of noise emissions.

Recommendation

Revise Condition 5.5.3 to:

5.5.3 The doors of the baling station are to be kept closed as far as is practicable **and full length, heavy duty, overlapping clear plastic vehicle drive through sheeting must be maintained in the door openings at all times.**

New Insertion for Schedule E: [see Appendix II]

New Insertion for Schedule F: [see Appendix II]

Ground 3: Inadequate management of the facility

The Greenpark Residents in their objection to the PD state that South Dublin County Council and IPODEC have failed to manage the Ballymount Baling Station within the terms of the current licence. They also state that the ongoing noise and odour problems associated with the facility are due to ineffective management.

Technical Committee's evaluation

Looking at the management track record, the technical committee noted the EPA letter dated 1/8/00 regarding a site inspection on the 27/7/00 where no Facility Manager was present. From the resident's statement, the committee consider that the principal difficulty that the residents have with the management of the facility is due to the ongoing issues over odour and noise as discussed under Grounds 1 & 2 above. The committee considers that the licensee should provide standby capacity (new Condition 4.20) and keep records of the servicing and maintenance of the waste processing and ventilation plant (Condition 3.13) in order to ensure that plant is available when required. The PD also requires that the management structure be agreed with the Agency prior to the operation of the facility on a 24 hour basis. The committee considers that it is essential that the licensee demonstrate their ability to manage the facility and comply with the conditions of their licence prior to the use of the facility as a 24 hour seven day week operation in order to minimise the impact of this operation on the surrounding environment (vis a vis odour, noise etc). For clarity on this issue, the technical committee suggest a minor rewording of Condition 5.6, and have linked this condition to the interpretation of the Working Day in the interpretation section of the licence. The committee considers that the licensee's communications programme must integrate with the local residents association. Also, Condition 5.5.1 of the original licence refers to Attachment E3 of the application for details of waste processing. Some of the proposals in this attachment are not in

keeping with other conditions of this licence and consequently the committee recommends an addition to Condition 5.5.1 to ensure consistency.

Recommendation

Revise "Working Day" in the Interpretation to;

Working Day 24 hours a day (subject to Condition 5.6).

Revise Condition 2.1.2 - v. Communications to;

v. Communications

Within three months from the date of grant of this licence, the licensee shall submit for agreement to the Agency a Communications Programme to ensure that members of the public can obtain information concerning the environmental performance of the facility at all reasonable times. **The communications programme shall include for liaison with local residents and their residents associations.**

Insert new Condition 3.13:

3.13 The licensee shall maintain service and maintenance records and schedules for all waste processing and ventilation plant.

Revise Condition 5.5.1 to;

5.5.1 All waste shall be processed as detailed in Attachment E3 of the application **unless otherwise instructed in this licence.** Any waste deemed unsuitable and/or in contravention of this licence shall be immediately separated and at the earliest possible time removed for recovery or disposal at an appropriate alternative facility.

Revise Condition 5.6 to;

5.6 Hours of operation

5.6.1 Until the Management Structure required by Condition 2.2 **and the duty waste handling capacity required by Condition 4.20 is agreed by the Agency and is in place,** the following shall be the hours of operation at the facility:

Civic Waste Facility: 8.00 to 18.00 Monday to Saturday.

Baling Station: 7.30 to 18.30 Monday to Saturday.

5.6.2 Thereafter, the hours of operation at the facility shall be:

Civic Waste Facility: 8.00 to 18.00 Monday to Sunday.

Baling Station: 24 hours per day, seven days per week.

Ground 4: Management renegeing on written guarantees given to the residents and the Waste Management Plan for Dublin outlining three baling facilities in Dublin.

The Greenpark Residents Association stated that they received written guarantees from South Dublin County Council outlining the conditions under which the baling station will operate. The residents state that SDCC are operating in breach of these promises. The written guarantees referred to by the residents are detailed in a letter from SDCC to the residents associated dated 25/2/94. The guarantees as detailed by the residents are:

1. The policy of Dublin Authorities was to provide 3 baling stations on the outskirts of the city
2. Ballymount station would be constructed and maintained to the highest environmental standards.
3. Noise would not be perceptible from the estate.
4. Waste would be removed from the station on the day received except for small quantities stored overnight in a locked building.
5. All waste to be removed from the station within 24 hours.
6. Waste would not be received after 4.30pm.
7. A management structure with details of the responsibility for each individual and contingency arrangement for the absences from the facility of that person.
8. Awareness and training procedures for personnel who work in the facility.
9. Record keeping, monitoring of emissions and environmental nuisances i.e. vermin, flies, odours.
10. Road signs to direct traffic to use main routes to the baling station.

Technical Committee's evaluation

In reviewing these issues, the technical committee compared the residents objections with the conditions of the PD. As many of these issues result from direct exchanges between the residents and the County Council the committee considers that it can address only those aspects relevant to the licensing of the facility.

1. Planning of additional baling stations is a matter for the Dublin Authorities.
2. While this is a planning matter for South Dublin County Council, the technical committee recognises that this issue is part of licence remit and compliance with the licence will address this concern.
3. Conditions 7.1 & 7.7 of the PD deal with noise emissions.
4. Condition 5.5.3 requires the licensee to keep the doors shut as far as is practical and the fitting of overlapping clear plastic sheeting in the door openings. Condition 5.5.5 requires that all wastes be compacted within 12 hours of acceptance into the baling station. Condition 6.9 prevents waste accumulation outside the waste reception area and requires all baled waste to be stored in enclosed containers pending removal.
5. Condition 6.1 requires that all baled waste be removed within 48 hours of baling.
6. The PD allows SDCC to accept waste up until 18.00 Monday to Saturday until the Management structure is agreed and in place. Thereafter, the hours of operation will be 24 hours per day 7 days a week. The licensee proposed to accept waste at the facility up to 24 hours per day.
7. Condition 2.2 deals with the management structure for the facility including responsibilities and contingencies. Details must be submitted by the licensee.
8. Condition 2.5 places an onus on the management of the facility to ensure that there is adequate training for personnel and that there is an awareness of the requirements of the licence.

9. Condition 3 of the PD deals with record keeping, Condition 6 deals with Environmental nuisances i.e. vermin, flies and odours, and Condition 9 deals with the environmental monitoring associated with the operation of the facility.
10. This is a matter for the local authority.

Recommendation

No Change

Signed:

Gerry Carty
Technical Committee Chairperson

Appendix I

Recommended changes to Schedules arising from Ground 1 (Odours)

New Insertion to Schedule B:

Annual Environmental Report Content

Duty and standby capacity of waste handling and ventilation plant.

New Insertion to Table C.1 of Schedule C:

Report	Reporting Frequency ^{Note1}	Report Submission Date
Monitoring of Emissions to Atmosphere & Air Quality	Quarterly	Ten days after end of the quarter being reported on

New Insertion into Schedule D:

Specified Engineering Works

Installation of negative air pressure and exit vent filter system

New Insertion into Schedule E:

E.5 Emissions to Atmosphere & Air Quality Monitoring

Table E.5.1 PM₁₀ and Odour Monitoring Frequency and Technique

Parameter ^{Note 1}	Monitoring Frequency	Analysis Method/Technique
PM ₁₀ ($\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$) ^{Note 4}	Quarterly	See ^{Note 2}
Odour ^{Note 5}	Quarterly ^{Note 3}	See ^{Note 3}

Note 1: Meteorological monitoring to be carried out concurrently with all above monitoring.

Note 2: As described in prEN12341 "Air Quality - field test procedure to demonstrate reference equivalence of sampling methods for PM10 fraction of particulate matter" or an alternative agreed in writing with the Agency.

Note 3: Odour measurements shall be by olfactometric measurement and analysis for mercaptans, hydrogen sulphide, ammonia, amines as set out in Table E 5.2.

Note 4: Locations for PM₁₀ sampling are as per Dust Monitoring locations above

Note 5: Location for odour sampling to be agreed with the Agency under Condition 4.20.4

Table E.5.2

Control Parameter	Monitoring Required ^{Note 2}	Monitoring Equipment	Backup Equipment
Ammonia	Weekly	Colorimetric Indicator Tubes ^{Note 1}	Spare tubes
Hydrogen sulphide	Weekly	Colorimetric Indicator Tubes ^{Note 1}	Spare tubes
Mercaptans	Weekly	Colorimetric Indicator Tubes ^{Note 1}	Spare tubes
Amines	Bi – annually	NIOSH method 2010 ^{Note 1}	-
Odour units	Bi-annually	Olfactometric	

Note 1: Or an equivalent method acceptable to the Agency.

Note 2: Records shall be kept at the facility of all monitoring and visual checks.

New Insertion for Schedule F:

F. 5 Emission Limit Values for air emissions

Emission point grid references (12 digit) to be submitted to the Agency subsequent to agreement [Condition 4.20.4].

Parameter	Emission Limit Value (ppm v/v)
Ammonia	50
Amines	5
Hydrogen Sulphide & Mercaptans	5

Appendix II

Recommended changes to Schedules arising from Ground 2 (Noise)

Include the following in *Table E.3.2 - Noise Monitoring Frequency and Technique* of Schedule E:

Parameter	Monitoring Frequency	Analysis Method/Technique
Frequency Analysis(1/3 Octave band analysis)	Annual	Standard ^{Note 1}

Note 1: "International Standards Organisation. ISO 1996. Acoustics - description and Measurement of Environmental noise. Parts 1, 2 and 3."

Include the following in *F.3 - Noise Emissions* of Schedule F:

Day dB(A) L _{Aeq} (30 minutes)	Night dB(A) L _{Aeq} (30 minutes)
Maximum noise levels: 85 dBA at 2m from source.	

Appendix III

Copy of Audit Reports of 2nd July 1999 and 7th December 1999

Appendix IV

Copy of Inspection Report of 22nd August 2000